Review Article Polymorphisms in the *interleukin-10* gene and Graves' disease: a meta-analysis

Xi Wei^{1*}, Yafeng Wang^{2*}, Mingqiang Kang^{3*}, Heping Jiang⁴, Chao Liu⁵, Weifeng Tang^{3,5}, Hao Qiu⁶, Shen zhang⁷, Jiakai Jiang⁷

Departments of ¹Pathology, ⁵Cardiothoracic Surgery, Affiliated People's Hospital of Jiangsu University, Zhenjiang, Jiangsu Province, China; ²Department of Cardiology, The People's Hospital of Xishuangbanna Dai Autonomous Prefecture, Jinghong, Yunnan Province, China; ³Department of Thoracic Surgery, The Union Clinical Medical College of Fujian Medical University, Fuzhou, Fujian Province, China; ⁴Department of Emergency, Affiliated Jintan People's Hospital of Jiangsu University, Jintan, China; ⁶Department of Immunology, School of Medicine, Jiangsu University, Zhenjiang, Jiangsu Province, China; ⁷Department of General Surgery, Changzhou No. 3 People's Hospital, Changzhou, Jiangsu Province, China. *Equal contributors.

Received May 12, 2016; Accepted September 25, 2016; Epub February 15, 2017; Published February 28, 2017

Abstract: The correlation between interleukin-10 (*IL-10*) common polymorphisms (rs1800896 A>G, rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T) and Gravesdisease (GD) has been widely studied; however, the findings remain conflicting. The objective of this meta-analysis was to address the relationship of polymorphisms in the *IL-10* gene with the risk of GD. PubMed, China National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI) and Chinese BioMedical Disc (CBM) databases were systematically searched by two reviewers independently to identify relevant studies before March19, 2016. Pooled odds ratios (ORs) and their 95% confidence intervals (Cls) for the correlation of *IL-10* gene polymorphisms with GD susceptibility were calculated by Stata 12.0 software. Tests for publication bias, sensitivity analyses, and heterogeneity were also assessed in our meta-analysis. A total of six publications comprising sixteen case-control studies concerning the IL-10 rs1800896 A>G, rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphisms were included in our study. The pooled results suggested that *IL-10* rs1800896 A>G polymorphism was correlated with an increased GD risk (G vs. A: OR = 1.58, 95% Cl = 1.24-2.48, P = 0.001 and GG vs. AA: OR = 5.01, 95% Cl = 2.32-6.37, P<0.001). In a stratified analysis by ethnicity, an increased GD risk was found among Asians and Caucasians. However, for *IL-10* rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphism was correlated with GD rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphisms are not associated with GD rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphism was correlated with an increased GD risk was found among Asians and Caucasians. However, for *IL-10* rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphisms are concerding the IL-10 rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphisms. However, for *IL-10* rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphisms are concerding that they were not associated with GD rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphisms, the results showed that they were not associated with GD rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphisms, the resul

Keywords: Polymorphism, IL-10, Graves' disease, susceptibility, meta-analysis

Introduction

Graves' disease (GD) is a common autoimmune disorder, approximately 2% of women and 0.2% of men affected. It is characterized by the presence of anti-thyroid stimulating antibodies leading to diffuse goiter, hyperthyroidism, Graves' ophthalmopathy and Graves' dermopathy [1]. Genetic predisposition and multiple environmental factors may be responsible for the development of GD. Recently, an inherited predisposition to GD was found [2]. However, the etiology of GD is complicated and remains largely unclear.

The human *interleukin-10 (IL-10)* gene is located on chromosome 1q32.2. The IL-10 is a ho-

modimer; each of its subunits has 178 amino acid residue [3]. IL-10, also known as human cytokine synthesis inhibitory factor, plays pleiotropic effects in anti-inflammatory and immunosuppression. It inhibits the expression of Th1 cytokines, co-stimulatory molecules and major histocompatibility complex class II antigens on macrophages. IL-10 inhibits lipopolysaccharide and bacterial product mediated induction of the pro-inflammatory cytokines predominantly, such as TNF α , IL-1 β , IL-12, IFN γ and so on [4-6]. Previous studies indicated that single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) in IL-10 gene were correlated with the susceptibility of multiple human autoimmune diseases, such as rheumatoid arthritis [7, 8], systemic lupus erythemato-



sus [9], Behcets disease [10] and inflammatory bowel disease [11] *et al.*

Recently, accumulating evidences highlighted IL-10 SNPs and haplotypes might play important roles in the development of GD [12, 13], specifically by influencing IL-10 expression levels [14]. IL-10 gene is polymorphic, and more than 1,200 SNPs have been established (http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/snp), such as rs1800896 A>G (-1082 A>G), rs1800872 A>C (-592 A>C), rs3021097 C>T (-819 C>T), rs3021094, rs3024496 and rs3790622 polymorphisms etc. Among them, the IL-10 rs1800896 A>G, rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>TSNPs were extensively studied for their implication in GD risk. However, all available findings from previous epidemiologic studies were conflicting rather than conclusive. Considering the vital role of IL-10 SNPs in the development of GD, we performed this metaanalysis on all eligible case-control studies to assess the GD susceptibility associated with IL-10 rs1800896 A>G, rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphisms. As far as we know, the present study is the most comprehensive meta-analysis carried out to date with respect to the relationship of *IL-10* polymorphisms with GD risk.

Materials and methods

Search strategy

To identify all potentially publications on the association between IL-10 polymorphisms and GD risk, we performed a systematic search on PubMed, China National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI) and Chinese BioMedical Disc (CBM) databases, covering all papers published up to March 19, 2016 without any language restrictions, by using the following terms: 'IL10/IL-10/interleukin-10/interleukin10', 'polymorphism/variant/SNP', 'GD/ Graves disease'. References provided in retrieved articles and review articles were manually searched.

Inclusion and exclusion criteria

The major selection criteria were: (a) full-text study, (b) evaluating the correlation of *IL-10* rs1800896 A>G, rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphisms with GD susceptibility, (c) unrelated case-control design, (d) containing sufficient data on genotype and allele frequency for estimating the odds ratios (ORs) with their 95% confidence intervals (Cls). Publications containing two or more case-control studies were considered as several independent investigations. Accordingly, papers without sufficient data, not case-control study design, letters, duplicated data, comments and reviews were excluded.

Data extraction

Two authors (X. Wei and Y. Wang) independently reviewed and extracted the following original data from all publications: the first author' surname, published year, country/ethnicity, number of case/control, genotyping method and data of allele and genotype frequency. In case of a conflicting evaluation, discrepancy was addressed by a detailed discussion among all authors.

Table 1. Characteristics of the eligible studies inc	cluded in the meta-analysis
--	-----------------------------

Year	Country	Ethnicity	No. of case/ control	Genotype method	polymorphisms
2015	China	Asians	118/138	PCR-RFLP	rs1800896 A>G
2013	Poland	Caucasians	735/1216	PCR-ARMS	rs1800896 A>G
2011	China	Asians	727/701	Taqman	rs1800896 A>G and rs1800872 A>C
2011	China	Asians	376/318	Taqman	rs1800896 A>G and rs1800872 A>C
2010	Iran	Caucasians	57/140	PCR-SSP	rs1800896 A>G, rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T
2010	Iran	Caucasians	50/140	PCR-SSP	rs1800896 A>G, rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T
2007	China	Asians	137/189	PCR-RFLP	rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T
2004	UK	Caucasians	630/864	Taqman	rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T
	Year 2015 2013 2011 2011 2010 2010 2007 2004	Year Country 2015 China 2013 Poland 2011 China 2010 Iran 2010 Iran 2010 China 2007 China 2004 UK	YearCountryEthnicity2015ChinaAsians2013PolandCaucasians2011ChinaAsians2011ChinaAsians2010IranCaucasians2010IranCaucasians2010ChinaAsians2010IranCaucasians2007ChinaAsians2004UKCaucasians	YearCountryEthnicityNo. of case/ control2015ChinaAsians118/1382013PolandCaucasians735/12162011ChinaAsians727/7012011ChinaAsians376/3182010IranCaucasians57/1402010IranCaucasians50/1402010ChinaAsians137/1892004UKCaucasians630/864	YearCountryEthnicityNo. of case/ controlGenotype method2015ChinaAsians118/138PCR-RFLP2013PolandCaucasians735/1216PCR-ARMS2011ChinaAsians727/701Taqman2011ChinaAsians376/318Taqman2010IranCaucasians57/140PCR-SSP2010IranCaucasians50/140PCR-SSP2007ChinaAsians137/189PCR-RFLP2004UKCaucasians630/864Taqman

PCR-RFLP: polymerase chain reaction-restriction fragment length polymorphism; PCR-ARMS: polymerase chain reaction-amplification refractory mutation system; PCR-SSP: polymerase chain reaction-sequence specific primer.

Table 2. Distribution of IL-10	polymorphisms	genotype and	allele
--------------------------------	---------------	--------------	--------

Polymorphism	Study	Case			(Contro		Ca	se	Control		HWE	
rs1800896 A>G		AA	AG	GG	AA	AG	GG	А	G	А	G		
	Liang et al.	74	37	7	87	49	2	185	51	223	53	0.09	
	Jurecka-Lubieniecka et al.	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	257	343	262	360	N/A	
	Liu et al.	608	109	10	629	69	3	1325	129	1327	75	0.458	
	Liu et al.	318	54	4	290	27	1	690	62	607	29	0.662	
	Khalilzadeh et al.	14	32	11	53	75	12	60	54	181	99	0.042	
	Khalilzadeh et al.	6	26	18	53	75	12	38	62	181	99	0.042	
rs1800872 A>C		AA	AC	CC	AA	AC	CC	А	С	А	С		
	Liu et al.	321	326	78	299	310	87	968	482	908	484	0.633	
	Liu et al.	169	163	44	133	152	33	501	251	418	218	0.278	
	Khalilzadeh et al.	8	32	17	12	57	71	48	66	81	199	0.907	
	Khalilzadeh et al.	16	26	8	12	57	71	58	42	81	199	0.907	
	Shiau et al.	62	54	17	72	52	10	178	88	196	72	0.885	
	Tait et al.	32	234	364	35	290	521	298	962	360	1332	0.498	
rs3021097 C>T		CC	СТ	TT	CC	CT	TT	С	Т	С	Т		
	Khalilzadeh et al.	15	34	8	71	57	12	64	50	199	81	0.907	
	Khalilzadeh et al.	6	28	16	71	57	12	40	60	199	81	0.907	
	Shiau et al.	19	57	59	13	71	91	95	175	97	253	0.868	
	Tait et al.	377	248	31	512	280	34	1002	310	1304	348	0.579	

HWE: Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium; N/A: not available.

Statistical analysis

We first evaluated the departure of frequencies of *IL*-10 rs1800896 A>G, rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T variants from expectation under Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (HWE) in controls by using an online goodness-of-fit test (http://ihg.gsf.de/cgi-bin/hw/hwa1.pl) [15, 16]. Crude Ors with their 95% Cls were used to measure the strength of the association between *IL*-10 rs1800896 A>G, rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T polymorphisms and GD risk. The statistical significance of the pooled ORs was assessed by the Z-test, and a *P*<0.05 was accepted as statistical significance. For *IL*-10 rs1800896 A>G, we measured the correlation between genetic variants and GD risk in allelic comparison (G vs. A), homozygote comparison (GG vs. AA), dominant comparison (GG+AG vs. AA) and recessive comparison (GG vs. AG+AA), respectively. The same method was harnessed to assess *IL*-10 rs1800872 A>C and rs3021-097 C>T polymorphisms. A Chi-square-based Q-test was used to assess heterogeneity among the included studies. $I^2>50\%$ or P<0.10 (two-sided) suggesting the significant heterogeneity, the random-effects model (the DerSimonian-Laird method) was used to pool the data

		No. of	Alleliccomparison			Homozygote	compar	ison	Dominanto	comparis	on	Recessive comparison		
Polymorphism		study	OR (95% CI)	Ρ	P (Q-test)	OR (95% CI)	Ρ	P (Q-test)	OR (95% CI)	Ρ	P (Q-test)	OR (95% CI)	Ρ	P (Q-test)
rs1800896A>G	Overall	6	1.58 (1.14-2.20)	0.007	<0.001	5.01 (2.81-8.94)	<0.001	0.422	1.75 (1.24-2.48)	0.001	0.075	3.84 (2.32-6.37)	<0.001	0.729
	Overall in HWE	4	1.36 (0.96-1.91)	0.080	0.006	3.69 (1.48-9.22)	0.005	0.986	1.57 (1.25-1.98)	<0.001	0.158	3.59 (1.44-8.94)	0.006	0.964
	Asians	3	1.60 (1.29-1.98)	<0.001	0.239	3.69 (1.48-9.22)	0.005	0.986	1.57 (1.25-1.98)	<0.001	0.158	3.59 (1.44-8.94)	0.006	0.964
	Caucasians	3	1.64 (0.84-3.21)	0.146	<0.001	6.63 (1.78-24.64)	0.005	0.081	2.67 (1.55-4.60)	<0.001	0.137	4.00 (2.20-7.25)	<0.001	0.166
rs1800872 A>C	Overall	6	0.79 (0.61-1.03)	0.078	<0.001	0.65 (0.37-1.15)	0.143	<0.001	0.79 (0.57-1.10)	0.161	0.006	0.74 (0.50-1.10)	0.133	<0.001
	Asians	3	0.98 (0.87-1.10)	0.728	0.203	0.97 (0.75-1.27)	0.849	0.174	0.96 (0.82-1.13)	0.661	0.352	0.99 (0.77-1.28)	0.964	0.184
	Caucasians	3	0.54 (0.28-1.03)	0.062	<0.001	0.30 (0.08-1.12)	0.073	0.001	0.47 (0.20-1.11)	0.086	0.019	0.43 (0.18-1.05)	0.064	<0.001
rs3021097 C>T	Overall	4	1.51 (0.85-2.68)	0.156	<0.001	2.15 (0.61-7.62)	0.237	<0.001	1.81 (0.75-4.34)	0.184	<0.001	1.54 (0.72-3.27)	0.265	<0.001

Table 3. Meta-analysis of the IL-10 polymorphisms and Graves' disease

HWE: Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium.



Figure 2. Meta-analysis with a random-effects model for the relationship of *IL*-10 rs1800896 A>G polymorphism with Graves' disease (GG+AG vs. AA compare genetic model).

[17], otherwise the fixed-effects model (the Mantel-Haenszel method) was utilized [18]. Subgroup analyses were performed according to ethnicity (Asians and Caucasians). Begg's funnel plot and Egger's linear regression test were harnessed to measure potential publication bias [19]. One-way sensitivity analysis was performed to examine whether an individual study would affect the stability of our results. For publication bias, a P<0.1 (two-sided) was designated as statistical significance. All statistical analyses were performed using STATA software (version 12.0, Stata Corporation, USA).

Results

Characteristics

In total of 754 relevant papers were retrieved. The detailed selecting and excluding process were listed in **Figure 1**. Finally, a total of sixteen case-control studies from six publications were identified. Overall, there were four publications (including six case-control studies) on the *IL*-10 rs1800896 A>G polymorphism, four articles (including six case-control studies) on the *IL-10* rs1800872 A>C polymorphism and three publications (including four case-control studies) on the *IL-10* rs3021097 C>T polymorphism. The characteristics of these included studies and the distribution of *IL-10* rs1800896 A>G, rs1800872 A>C and rs3021097 C>T variants as well as alleles are summarized in **Tables 1** and **2**, respectively.

Quantitative synthesis

IL-10 rs1800896 A>G polymorphism: There were four publications met the major selecting criteria with 1,328GD cases and 1,437 controls [13, 14, 20-23]. Two articles (Liu *et al.* and Khalilzadeh *et al.*) containing two case-control studies in each of them were considered as several independent investigations [13, 21]. In total, there were six case-control studies included in the present meta-analysis. Among these studies, three were Asian [13, 14, 20], three were Caucasian [21-23]. Overall, *IL-10* rs1800896 A>G polymorphism was associated with overall GD risk (OR, 1.58; 95% CI, 1.14-2.20; P = 0.007 for G vs. A; OR, 5.01; 95% CI,



Figure 3. Begg's funnel plot of meta-analysis of the relationship between *IL-10* rs1800896 A>G polymorphism and the risk of Graves' disease (GG+AG vs. AA compare genetic model).



Figure 4. Begg's funnel plot of meta-analysis of the relationship between *IL-10* rs1800872 A>C polymorphism and the risk of Graves' disease (C vs. A compare genetic model).

2.81-8.94; P<0.001 for GG vs. AA; OR, 1.75; 95% Cl, 1.24-2.48; P = 0.001 for GG+AG vs. AA and OR, 3.84; 95% Cl, 2.32-6.37; P<0.001 for GG vs. AA+AG) (**Table 3** and **Figure 2**). In a subgroup analysis by ethnicity, a significant increased GD risk was identified among Asians (OR, 1.60; 95% Cl, 1.29-1.98; P<0.001 for G vs. A; OR, 3.69; 95% Cl, 1.48-9.22; P = 0.005 for GG vs. AA; OR, 1.57; 95% Cl, 1.25-1.98; P<0.001 for GG+AG vs. AA and OR, 3.59; 95% Cl, 1.44-8.94; P = 0.006 for GG vs. AA+AG) and Caucasians (OR, 6.63; 95% Cl, 1.78-24.64; P =

0.005 for GG vs. AA; OR, 2.67; 95% CI, 1.55-4.60; P<0.001 for GG+AG vs. AA and OR, 4.00; 95% CI, 2.20-7.25; P<0.001 for GG vs. AA+AG). Other comparison results are listed in **Table 3**.

IL-10 rs1800872 A>C polymorphism: There were four papers met the inclusion criteria with 1,971 GD cases and 2.274 controls. Two articles (Liu et al. and Khalilzadeh et al.) provided two subgroups in each of them; thus, reviewers treated them separately [13, 21]. In total, there were six case-control studies included in this mata-analysis. Among them, three casecontrol studies were Caucasian and three were Asian. Overall, there was null correlation of IL-10 rs1800872 A>C polymorphism with GD risk (Table 3). In a subgroup analysis by ethnicity, the similar findings were found in Asians and Caucasians (Table 3).

IL-10 rs3021097 C>T polymorphism: A total of 898-GD cases and 1,281 controls from four case-control studies were included on the relationship between *IL-10* rs3021097 C>T polymorphism and GD susceptibility. One case-control

study was Asian and three were Caucasian. Results of this study did not show any statistical evidence of an association between *IL-10* rs3021097 C>T polymorphism and GD susceptibility (**Table 3**). For limited data, subgroup analyses were not performed.

Tests for publication bias, sensitivity analyses, and heterogeneity

As reflected by Begg's funnel plot and Egger's linear regression test (**Figures 3** and **4**), there







Figure 6. Sensitivity analysis of the influence of C vs. A compare genetic model (random-effects estimates for *IL-10* rs1800872 A>C polymorphism).

was no publication bias in this meta-analysis (*IL-10* rs1800896 A>G polymorphism: G vs. A: Begg's test P = 0.133, Egger's linear regression test P = 0.105; GG vs. AA: Begg's test P = 0.806, Egger's linear regression test P = 0.736; GG+AG vs. AA: Begg's test P = 0.462, Egger's linear regression test P = 0.488; GG vs. AG+AA: Begg's test P = 1.000, Egger's linear regression test P = 0.786; *IL-10* rs1800872 A>C polymorphism: C vs. A: Begg's test P = 0.260, Egger's linear regression test P = 0.292; CC vs. AA: Begg's test P = 0.452, Egger's linear regression test P = 0.361; CC+AC vs. AA: Begg's test P = 0.133, Egger's linear regression test P = 0.237; CC vs. AC+AA: Begg's test P = 0.707, Egger's linear regression test P = 0.533).

For IL-10 rs1800896 A>G and rs1800872 A>C polymorphism, we conducted one-way sensitivity analyses to measure the effect of an individual study on pooled ORs and Cls (Figures 5 and 6). The pooled ORs and CIs were similar before and after omitting of each study in turn, suggesting that our findings were relatively stable. As listed in Table 3, significant heterogeneity was found in our study. Thus, we assessed the sources of heterogeneity by subgroup meta-analysis (Table 3). The results showed that Caucasians subgroup may contribute to the major sources of heterogeneity for both IL-10 rs1800896 A>G and rs-1800872 A>C polymorphism (Table 3).

Discussion

GD is an autoimmune disorder and causes the majority of hyperthyroidism cases. Recently, some studies have highlighted that GD is a complex disease with

genetic predisposition [24, 25]. Interaction among multiple genetic variants may alter the susceptibility of GD [12-14]. IL-10 has pleiotropic anti-inflammatory and immuno-suppressive effects by inhibiting the production of proinflammatory mediators, and decreasing T cell stimulation and/or energy. The level of serum IL-10 is significantly low in healthy subjects; however, it is elevated with GD [14]. These studies also indicated that IL-10 may be a potential biomarker which was correlated with the development of GD [14, 26]. Recently, several epidemiological studies have focused on the association of IL-10 common polymorphisms with GD risk. The rs1800896 A>G polymorphism in IL-10 gene has been extensively studied. In 2010, Khalilzadeh et al. reported that an $A \rightarrow G$ intron variant in rs1800896 polymorphism was associated with GD susceptibility [21]. Subsequently, Liu et al. reported a similar finding [13]. In this metaanalysis, we found that IL-10 rs1800896 A>G polymorphism significantly increased the risk of GD, suggesting the presence of the G allele. which led to higher IL-10 serum level, might increase the risk of GD [27]. In a subgroup analysis for ethnicity, IL-10 rs1800896 A>G polymorphism was associated with the increased risk of GD in Asians and Caucasians. Two casecontrol studies did not conform to HWE [21]. When we discarded these studies, the association between IL-10 rs1800896 A>G polymorphism and GD risk was also significant in homozygote comparison, dominant comparison and recessive comparison models (OR, 3.69; 95% CI, 1.48-9.22; P = 0.005 for GG vs. AA; OR, 1.57; 95% CI, 1.25-1.98; P<0.001 for GG+AG vs. AA and OR, 3.59; 95% CI, 1.44-8.94; P = 0.006 for GG vs. AG+AA; Table 3), suggesting the robustness of our results.

There were six case-control studies for IL-10 rs1800872 A>C polymorphism and GD risk. Shiau et al. reported a positive signal of IL-10 rs1800872 A>C polymorphism with GD susceptibility [20]; the other study found that IL-10 rs1800872 A>C polymorphism was associated with the decrease the risk of GD [21]. As shown in Table 3, we found that IL-10 rs1800872 A>C polymorphism was not associated with the risk of GD. However, IL-10 rs1800872 A>C variants were correlated with a borderline statistically decreased susceptibility of GD in overall and Caucasians (Table 3). For this meta-analysis, only six studies were included, which may restrict power to measure a real influence of IL-10 rs1800872 A>C polymorphism with GD. Large heterogeneities among the included studies should also be taken into account. In the future, more large scale studies are needed to further explore this potential association. For IL-10 rs3021097 C>T polymorphism, four casecontrol studies with 898 GD cases and 1,281 controls were included on the relationship between this polymorphism and GD susceptibility. As listed in Table 3, IL-10 rs3021097 C>T polymorphism was not associated with the risk of GD. For limited data, a subgroup analysis was not performed.

In interpreting these findings, certain limitations in our study should be addressed. Firstly, due to lack of detailed data presented in the included publications, the possible effect of vital risk factors to GD was not assessed, such as age, sex, family history and environmental factors et al. Secondly, the sample size of this meta-analysis is relatively small. Thirdly, significant heterogeneity existed in our study, the results should be interpreted with very cautiously. Finally, although Begg's funnel plot and Egger's linear regression test did not detect any bias in the current study, we should also admit the potential of publication bias. Some studies may not have been enrolled online or negative/ non-significant studies may be unpublished so far.

In conclusion, despite these limitations, this meta-analysis highlights that *IL-10* rs1800896 A>G polymorphism may contribute to increased susceptibility of GD. Nevertheless, for practical reasons, well-designed association studies with large sample sizes in diverse ethnicities incorporating with functional assessments are warranted.

Acknowledgements

This study was supported in part by Fujian Province Natural Science Foundation (2013-J01126, 2013J05116).

Disclosure of conflict of interest

None.

Address correspondence to: Mingqiang Kang, Department of Thoracic Surgery, The Union Clinical Medical College of Fujian Medical University, Fuzhou 350001, China. E-mail: Mingqiang_Kang@126.com; Jiakai Jiang, Department of General Surgery, Changzhou No. 3 People's Hospital, Changzhou 213000, China. E-mail: jackjiang78@sina.com

References

- [1] Weetman AP. Graves' disease. N Engl J Med 2000; 343: 1236-1248.
- [2] Zeitlin AA, Simmonds MJ and Gough SC. Genetic developments in autoimmune thyroid

disease: an evolutionary process. Clin Endocrinol (0xf) 2008; 68: 671-682.

- [3] Zdanov A, Schalk-Hihi C, Gustchina A, Tsang M, Weatherbee J and Wlodawer A. Crystal structure of interleukin-10 reveals the functional dimer with an unexpected topological similarity to interferon gamma. Structure 1995; 3: 591-601.
- [4] Varma TK, Toliver-Kinsky TE, Lin CY, Koutrouvelis AP, Nichols JE and Sherwood ER. Cellular mechanisms that cause suppressed gamma interferon secretion in endotoxin-tolerant mice. Infect Immun 2001; 69: 5249-5263.
- [5] Aste-Amezaga M, Ma X, Sartori A and Trinchieri G. Molecular mechanisms of the induction of IL-12 and its inhibition by IL-10. J Immunol 1998; 160: 5936-5944.
- [6] Opp MR, Smith EM and Hughes TK Jr. Interleukin-10 (cytokine synthesis inhibitory factor) acts in the central nervous system of rats to reduce sleep. J Neuroimmunol 1995; 60: 165-168.
- [7] Ying B, Shi Y, Pan X, Song X, Huang Z, Niu Q, Cai B and Wang L. Association of polymorphisms in the human IL-10 and IL-18 genes with rheumatoid arthritis. Mol Biol Rep 2011; 38: 379-385.
- [8] Gambhir D, Lawrence A, Aggarwal A, Misra R, Mandal SK and Naik S. Association of tumor necrosis factor alpha and IL-10 promoter polymorphisms with rheumatoid arthritis in North Indian population. Rheumatol Int 2010; 30: 1211-1217.
- [9] Liu P, Song J, Su H, Li L, Lu N, Yang R and Peng Z. IL-10 gene polymorphisms and susceptibility to systemic lupus erythematosus: a meta-analysis. PLoS One 2013; 8: e69547.
- [10] Talaat RM, Ashour ME, Bassyouni IH and Raouf AA. Polymorphisms of interleukin 6 and interleukin 10 in Egyptian people with Behcet's disease. Immunobiology 2014; 219: 573-582.
- [11] Zou L, Wang L, Gong X, Zhao H, Jiang A and Zheng S. The association between three promoter polymorphisms of IL-10 and inflammatory bowel diseases (IBD): a meta-analysis. Autoimmunity 2014; 47: 27-39.
- [12] Khalilzadeh O, Anvari M, Momen-Heravi F, Esteghamati A, Rashidi A, Mahmoudi M, Nikbin B and Amirzargar A. Gene polymorphisms of interleukin-4, interleukin-10 and transforming growth factor-beta in Graves' disease. Clin Exp Med 2010; 10: 123-128.
- [13] Liu N, Lu H, Tao F, Guo T, Liu C, Cui B and Ning G. An association of interleukin-10 gene polymorphisms with Graves' disease in two Chinese populations. Endocrine 2011; 40: 90-94.
- [14] Liang C, Du W, Dong Q, Liu X, Li W, Wang Y and Gao G. Expression levels and genetic polymor-

phisms of interleukin-2 and interleukin-10 as biomarkers of Graves' disease. Exp Ther Med 2015; 9: 925-930.

- [15] Tang W, Wang Y, Jiang H, Liu P, Liu C, Gu H, Chen S and Kang M. Programmed death-1 (PD-1) rs2227981 C > T polymorphism is associated with cancer susceptibility: a metaanalysis. Int J Clin Exp Med 2015; 8: 22278-22285.
- [16] Tang W, Yu P, Wang Y, Kang M, Sun B, Yin J and Gu H. Lack of association between cyclin D1 A870G (rs9344) polymorphism and esophageal squamous cell carcinoma risk: case-control study and meta-analysis. Int J Clin Exp Med 2015; 8: 12685-12695.
- [17] DerSimonian R and Laird N. Meta-analysis in clinical trials. Control Clin Trials 1986; 7: 177-188.
- [18] Mantel N, Haenszel W. Statistical aspects of the analysis of data from retrospective studies of disease. J Natl Cancer Inst 1959; 22: 719-748.
- [19] Egger M, Davey Smith G, Schneider M and Minder C. Bias in meta-analysis detected by a simple, graphical test. BMJ 1997; 315: 629-634.
- [20] Shiau MY, Huang CN, Yang TP, Hwang YC, Tsai KJ, Chi CJ and Chang YH. Cytokine promoter polymorphisms in Taiwanese patients with Graves' disease. Clin Biochem 2007; 40: 213-217.
- [21] Khalilzadeh O, Anvari M, Esteghamati A, Momen-Heravi F, Rashidi A, Amiri HM, Tahvildari M, Mahmoudi M and Amirzargar A. Genetic susceptibility to Graves' ophthalmopathy: The role of polymorphisms in anti-inflammatory cytokine genes. Ophthalmic Genet 2010; 31: 215-220.
- [22] Tait KF, Nithiyananthan R, Heward JM, Barnett AH, Franklyn JA and Gough SC. Polymorphisms of interleukin 4 receptor gene and interleukin 10 gene are not associated with Graves' disease in the UK. Autoimmunity 2004; 37: 189-194.
- [23] Jurecka-Lubieniecka B, Ploski R, Kula D, Krol A, Bednarczuk T, Kolosza Z, Tukiendorf A, Szpak-Ulczok S, Stanjek-Cichoracka A, Polanska J and Jarzab B. Association between age at diagnosis of Graves' disease and variants in genes involved in immune response. PLoS One 2013; 8: e59349.
- [24] Akamizu T, Nakamura Y, Tamaoki A, Inaba Y, Amino N and Seino Y. Prevalence and clinicoepidemiology of familial Graves' disease in Japan based on nationwide epidemiologic survey in 2001. Endocr J 2003; 50: 429-436.
- [25] Collins J and Gough S. Autoimmunity in thyroid disease. Eur J Nucl Med Mol Imaging 2002; 29 Suppl 2: S417-424.

- [26] Itoh M, Uchimura K, Makino M, Kobayashi T, Hayashi R, Nagata M, Kakizawa H, Fujiwara K and Nagasaka A. Production of IL-10 and IL-12 in CD40 and interleukin 4-activated mononuclear cells from patients with Graves' disease. Cytokine 2000; 12: 688-693.
- [27] Turner DM, Williams DM, Sankaran D, Lazarus M, Sinnott PJ and Hutchinson IV. An investigation of polymorphism in the interleukin-10 gene promoter. Eur J Immunogenet 1997; 24: 1-8.