# Original Article TLR4 +896A>G (Asp299Gly) polymorphism is not associated with asthma: a update meta-analysis

Yingshui Yao<sup>1,2</sup>, Xiaohua Ren<sup>2</sup>, Lianping He<sup>2</sup>, Jie Li<sup>2</sup>, Yuelong Jin<sup>2</sup>, Weiwei Chang<sup>2</sup>, Chaopin Li<sup>1,3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Laboratory of Environment and Health, School of Earth and Environment, Anhui University of Science and Technology, Huainan 232001 China; <sup>2</sup>School of Public Health, <sup>3</sup>Department of Medical Parasitology, Wannan Medical College, Wuhu 241002 China

Received November 19, 2014; Accepted November 20, 2014; Epub December 15, 2014; Published December 30, 2014

**Abstract:** Some research reported that polymorphisms in the toll-Like receptor 4 may have influence on asthma risk. Here, we sought to estimate the effects of Toll-Like Receptor 4 (Asp299Gly) genes on asthma risk. Databases including PubMed and Chinese National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI) databases were searched to find relevant studies. The odds ratio (OR) with corresponding 95% confidence intervals (CIs) was performed. A total of 12 case-control studies were finally identified. This meta-analysis indicated that no significant association was found between TLR4 (Asp299Gly) genes and asthma risk (OR = 0.91, 95% CI = 0.71-1.12). In conclusion, our findings suggest that TLR4 +896A>G (Asp299Gly) polymorphism may not contribute to the risk of asthma.

Keywords: Toll-Like Receptor 4, single nucleotide polymorphism, asthma, polymorphism, meta-analysis

### Introduction

Asthma is a chronic inflammatory airway disease, and is characterized by recurrent attacks of breathlessness and wheezing. The World Health Organization estimates that the global prevalence rates of doctor diagnosed asthma, clinical/treated asthma and wheezing in adults were 4.3%, 4.5%, and 8.6% respectively [1], and asthma occurs in all countries regardless of the level of development [2]. Asthma exhibits a complex etiology, resulting from interactions between genetic and environment factors. Studies indicate that asthma has significant genetic contributions, with heritability estimates varying between 35% and 95% [3]. Therefore, a complete understanding of the genetic risk factors for asthma is important to develop new treatments or prevention strategies. So far, a large number of studies have focused on this field [4].

Toll-Like Receptor 4 (TLR4) is a surface receptor expressed in macrophages and other cell types [5, 6], The receptor detects lipopolysaccharide (LPS) [7, 8] and plays an important role in the LPS-mediated activation of the innate immune system [9]. An A-to-G missense nucleotide substitution in the TLR4 gene (rs4986790; also reported as Asp299Gly) has been demonstrated to result in the reduction of cell surface expression of TLR4. Some researched revealed that TLR4 gene is not associated with asham [9, 10]. Meta analysis given the number of accumulated data can increase the statistical power and the precision of effect estimates.

The aim of the study is to obtain the relationship between Toll-Like Receptor 4 (Asp299Gly) genes polymorphism and asthma.

### Materials and methods

### Literature search

PubMed and Chinese National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI) databases (accessed October 22, 2014) were searched using the search terms: 'asthma' or 'asthmatic', 'Toll-Like Receptor 4' or 'TLR4', and 'polymorphism' or 'mutation' or 'variant'. We also searched the reference lists of the initially identified studies for any additional relevant studies. The reference lists of the identified articles were also examined by two independent reviewers. Disagreements of the results were resolved via consensus.



Figure 1. Flow diagram.

## Inclusion and exclusion criteria

We included study met the following criteria: (1) the publication was a case-control; (2) the results of study offer sample information and related information that can calculate the sample size; (3) publication language was confined to English and Chinese; (4) genotype distribution of controls were in Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (HWE). All case reports, reviews animal studies and studies with incomplete data were excluded. The articles in the final analysis were in English and Chinese.

# Data extraction

Two reviewers independently extracted data from the relevant article. Disagreements were resolved through discussion and arbitration by another author. The following variable was extracted: first author, year of publication, country, age, controls, and the allele and genotype counts or frequencies of each SNP included.

# Statistical analysis

The pooled odds ratios (ORs) and 95% confidence interval (CI) were used to assess the associations between the genetic variants of Toll-Like Receptor 4 and asthma risk. Heterogeneity assumption was evaluated by Q-test and  $l^2$  test [11]. A significant Q-test (P <0.10) indicated heterogeneity across studies.  $l^2$ values were classified as low (< 25%), moderate (25-50%), and high (> 50%) heterogeneity,

respectively [12]. When there was no statistical heterogeneity, we used a fixed effects model (the Mantel-Haenszel method) [13]. The meta-analysis was performed using software Review Manager (RevMan, version 5.2, The Cochrane Collaboration), *P* value less than 0.05 was considered statistically significant.

## Results

The primary search generated 50 potentially relevant articles. After reviewing these articles, 1 systematic review was excluded [14], 5

articles were excluded for animal study, and 32 articles were excluded because they did not provide sufficient data for this study. Thus, a total of 12 case-control studies were finally identified (**Figure 1**). The detailed characteristics of included studies and the genotype and allele distributions are summarized in **Table 1**. The forest plots are showed in **Figure 2**, and possible publication bias are showed in **Figure 3**.

# Discussion

On the basis of 12 case-control studies involving 1838 asthma cases and 1764 controls, the present meta-analysis did not find a significant heterogeneity between-study, and significant association between the TLR4 (Asp299Gly) polymorphism and asthma.

Asthma is a common and complex pulmonary disorder. It was thought that asthma is a result of a combination of environmental factors and the accumulation of genetic variation. In future study we should explore the interaction of gene and environment on asthma.

There are some limitations to this review need to be taken into consideration when interpreting the findings. First, although multiple sources of literature were consulted and obvious publication bias was not detected, the effects of language bias and file drawer problem may impede the completeness of evidence. Second, the asthma phenotype was not consistently defined across studies, which may undermine

Author (vooro)	Country		Patients	Controls		
Author (years)	Country	n-	AA/(AG/GG)	n	AA/AG/GG	HWE
Adjers et al (2005) [15]	Finland	243	202/41	401	334/67	0.973
Carvalho et al (2008) [16]	The united kingdom	14	12/2	80	70/10	0.551
Hussein et al [17] (2012)	Egypt	500	434/66	251	223/28	0.851
J. Wang et al [10] (2014)	China	126	126/0	126	126/0	< 0.01
Lachheb et al [18] (2008)	Tunisia	210	209/1	224	223/1	< 0.01
Liu et al [19] (2005)	China	197	161/36	156	128/28	0.006
Sahin F et al (2014) [20]	Turkey	131	122/9	75	71/4	0.77
Smit et al [21] (2007)	Denmark	100	91/9	87	78/9	0.611
Voronko et al [22] (2011)	Russia	276	245/31	227	200/27	0.341
Yang et al [23] (2004)	The united kingdom	185	155/30	179	159/20	0.603
Yufeng Sun et al [24] (2013)	China	50	50/0	30	30/0	-
Zaborowski et al [25] (2011)	Poland	106	94/12	159	142/17	0.476

Table 1. Characteristic	s of studies included
-------------------------	-----------------------

The heterogeneity among studies included was not significant (Q = 2.22: P = 0.99,  $I^2 = 0\%$ ), This meta-analysis indicated that no significant association was found between TLR4 (Asp299Gly) genes and asthma risk (OR = 0.91, 95% Cl = 0.71-1.12).

	Experim	ental	Contr	ol		Odds Ratio	Odds Ratio	
Study or Subgroup	Events	Total	Events	Total	Weight	M-H, Fixed, 95% C	M-H, Fixed, 95% Cl	
Adjers et al	202	243	334	401	22.5%	0.99 [0.65, 1.51]	+	
Carvalho et al	12	14	70	80	1.6%	0.86 [0.17, 4.41]		
Hussein et al	434	500	223	251	20.7%	0.83 [0.52, 1.32]		
J.Wang et al	126	126	126	126		Not estimable		
Lachheb et al	209	210	223	224	0.5%	0.94 [0.06, 15.08]		
Liu et al	161	197	128	156	13.8%	0.98 [0.57, 1.69]	-	
Sahin F et al	122	131	71	75	3.3%	0.76 [0.23, 2.57]		
Smit et al	91	100	78	87	4.0%	1.17 [0.44, 3.08]	<b>-</b> _	
Voronko et al	245	276	200	227	13.0%	1.07 [0.62, 1.85]	+	
Yang et al	155	185	159	179	13.8%	0.65 [0.35, 1.19]		
Yufeng Sun et al	50	50	30	30		Not estimable		
Zaborowski et al	94	106	142	159	6.8%	0.94 [0.43, 2.05]		
Total (95% Cl)		2138		1995	100.0%	0.91 [0.74, 1.12]	•	
Total events	1901		1784					
Heterogeneity: Chi <sup>2</sup> = 2.22, df = 9 (P = 0.99); l <sup>2</sup> = 0%								
Test for overall effect:	Z = 0.89 (P	= 0.37)				E,	0.01 0.1 1 10 100 avours [experimental] Favours [control]	
						Fé	avours [experimental] Favours [control]	

Figure 2. Forest plots of TLR4 +896 AG/GG versus AA genotypes for all studies included in the meta-analysis.



**Figure 3.** Forest plots of TLR4 +896 AG/GG versus AA genotypes for all studies included in the meta-analysis.

the validity of the met analysis. Likewise, the reference groups were not uniuniformly defined,

with some studies recruiting population based controls, while others recruitinghospital-basedcontrols.Studies with controls in violation of HWE have been shown to give significantly different results from studies with controls conforming to HWE.

### Conclusion

Our findings suggest that TLR4 +896A>G (Asp299Gly) polymorphism may not contribute to the risk of asthma.

### Acknowledgements

This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (No. 30872367 and 81270091). The authors would also like to thank the editors of this manuscript.

## Disclosure of conflict of interest

## None.

Address correspondence to: Dr. Chaopin Li, Laboratory of Environment and Health, School of Earth and Environment, Anhui University of Science and Technology, Huainan, Anhui 232001, China. Tel: (+86 553) 3932482; Fax: (+86 553) 3932587; E-mail: cpli001@126.com

## References

- [1] To T, Stanojevic S, Moores G, Gershon AS, Bateman ED, Cruz AA and Boulet LP. Global asthma prevalence in adults: findings from the cross-sectional world health survey. BMC Public Health 2012; 12: 204.
- [2] Lee CC, Lai YT, Chang HT, Liao JW, Shyu WC, Li CY and Wang CN. Inhibition of high-mobility group box 1 in lung reduced airway inflammation and remodeling in a mouse model of chronic asthma. Biochem Pharmacol 2013; 86: 940-949.
- [3] Ober C and Yao TC. The genetics of asthma and allergic disease: a 21st century perspective. Immunol Rev 2011; 242: 10-30.
- [4] Fu JJ, Baines KJ, Wood LG and Gibson PG. Systemic inflammation is associated with differential gene expression and airway neutrophilia in asthma. OMICS 2013; 17: 187-199.
- [5] Garay-Malpartida HM, Mourao RF, Mantovani M, Santos IA, Sogayar MC and Goldberg AC. Toll-like receptor 4 (TLR4) expression in human and murine pancreatic beta-cells affects cell viability and insulin homeostasis. BMC Immunol 2011; 12: 18.
- [6] Parker LC, Whyte MK, Vogel SN, Dower SK and Sabroe I. Toll-like receptor (TLR)2 and TLR4 agonists regulate CCR expression in human monocytic cells. J Immunol 2004; 172: 4977-4986.
- [7] Aderem A and Ulevitch RJ. Toll-like receptors in the induction of the innate immune response. Nature 2000; 406: 782-787.
- [8] Yang H, Wang B, Wang T, Xu L, He C, Wen H, Yan J, Su H and Zhu X. Toll-Like Receptor 4 Prompts Human Breast Cancer Cells Invasiveness via Lipopolysaccharide Stimulation and Is Overexpressed in Patients with Lymph Node Metastasis. PLoS One 2014; 9: e109980.
- [9] Liu J, Buisman-Pijlman F and Hutchinson MR. Toll-like receptor 4: innate immune regulator of neuroimmune and neuroendocrine interactions in stress and major depressive disorder. Front Neurosci 2014; 8: 309.
- [10] Wang J, Simayi M, Wushouer Q, Xia Y, He Y, Yan F, Zhang J, Cui S and Wen H. Association between polymorphisms in ADAM33, CD14, and TLR4 with asthma in the Uygur population in China. Genet Mol Res 2014; 13: 4680-4690.
- [11] Higgins J and Thompson S. Quantifying heterogeneity in a meta-analysis. Stat Med 2002; 21: 1539-1558.
- [12] Higgins JP, Thompson SG, Deeks JJ and Altman DG. Measuring inconsistency in meta-analyses. BMJ 2003; 327: 557-560.
- [13] Mantel N and Haenszel W. Statistical aspects of the analysis of data from retrospective studies of disease. J Natl Cancer Inst 1959; 22: 719-748.

- [14] Potaczek DP, Nastalek M, Okumura K, Wojas-Pelc A, Undas A and Nishiyama C. An association of TLR2-16934A >T polymorphism and severity/phenotype of atopic dermatitis. J Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol 2011; 25: 715-721.
- [15] Adjers K, Karjalainen J, Pessi T, Eklund C and Hurme M. Epistatic effect of TLR4 and IL4 genes on the risk of asthma in females. Int Arch Allergy Immunol 2005; 138: 251-256.
- [16] Carvalho A, Pasqualotto AC, Pitzurra L, Romani L, Denning DW and Rodrigues F. Polymorphisms in toll-like receptor genes and susceptibility to pulmonary aspergillosis. J Infect Dis 2008; 197: 618-621.
- [17] Hussein YM, Awad HA, Shalaby SM, Ali AS and Alzahrani SS. Toll-like receptor 2 and Toll-like receptor 4 polymorphisms and susceptibility to asthma and allergic rhinitis: a case-control analysis. Cell Immunol 2012; 274: 34-38.
- [18] Lachheb J, Dhifallah IB, Chelbi H, Hamzaoui K and Hamzaoui A. Toll-like receptors and CD14 genes polymorphisms and susceptibility to asthma in Tunisian children. Tissue Antigens 2008; 71: 417-425.
- [19] RM L, JM W and TP C. Asp299Gly and Thr399lle polymorphisms in the toll-like receptor 4 and the susceptivity of allergic asthma and IgE level. Chin J Microbiol Immunol 2005; 25: 94-97.
- [20] Sahin F, Yildiz P, Kuskucu A, Kuskucu MA, Karaca N and Midilli K. The effect of CD14 and TLR4 gene polymorphisms on asthma phenotypes in adult Turkish asthma patients: a genetic study. BMC Pulm Med 2014; 14: 20.
- [21] Smit LA, Bongers SI, Ruven HJ, Rijkers GT, Wouters IM, Heederik D, Omland O and Sigsgaard T. Atopy and new-onset asthma in young Danish farmers and CD14, TLR2, and TLR4 genetic polymorphisms: a nested case-control study. Clin Exp Allergy 2007; 37: 1602-1608.
- [22] Voron'ko OE, Dmitrieva-Zdorova EV, Latysheva EA, Aksenova MG, Storozhakov GI, Bodoev NV and Archakov AI. [CARD15 and TLR4 genes polymorphisms in atopic bronchial asthma]. Mol Biol (Mosk) 2011; 45: 831-839.
- [23] Yang IA, Barton SJ, Rorke S, Cakebread JA, Keith TP, Clough JB, Holgate ST and Holloway JW. Toll-like receptor 4 polymorphism and severity of atopy in asthmatics. Genes Immun 2004; 5: 41-45.
- [24] Yu-Feng S, Xiao-Yue C and Wei-Jing S. Correlation study of gene polymorphism of TNF- $\alpha$ and TLR4 to bronchial asthma of Han nationality in Neimenggu area. Journal of Clinical Pulmonary Medicine 2013; 18: 662-665.
- [25] T Z, K WK, P K, O J, J S, T K, M G and J M. The effect of CD14 and TLR4 gene polymorphisms on the occurrence of atopic and non-atopic asthma. Adv Clin Exp Med 2011; 20: 413-421.